

Book Review**Open Access**

***Emerging Threats to Human Rights: Resources, Violence, and Deprivation of Citizenship*, edited by Heather Smith-Cannoy. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2019. 288 pages. ISBN-10: 1439917191; ISBN-13: 978-1439917190. RRP: A\$93.00, paperback.**

Reviewed by Kelly Soderstrom, University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Australia.

<https://doi.org/10.2478/jcgs-2019-0005>

Increased migration and forced displacement of people across the globe is a fact of our contemporary world that demands further attention from scholars. While traditional approaches to understanding the drivers of such migration have emphasised the political structures that incentivise and facilitate movement, contributors to *Emerging Threats to Human Rights: Resources, Violence, and Deprivation of Citizenship*, edited by Heather Smith-Cannoy, argue that a human rights focus is necessary to comprehensively investigate contemporary migration patterns and challenges. To this end, contributors to this book analyse threats to human rights as a driver for migration from three interrelated but analytically discrete sources: resource degradation, violence, and deprivation of citizenship. According to Smith-Cannoy, these emerging threats to human rights pose an existential threat, which, in line with Alexander Betts' (2013) notion of "survival migrants," drives displacement. Through an analysis of each threat to human rights, presented as separate studies organised by type of threat, the book ultimately concludes that variation in the extent to which each threat drives migration can be understood on a spectrum from low to high drivers of migration. Although there is little evidence that resource degradation through climate change is currently leading to mass migration, deprivation of citizenship and violence appear to be correlated with moderate and high levels of mass migration respectively. As Smith-Cannoy argues, "a core theme that emerges from this investigation is that there is value in looking across issue areas to understand threats to human rights and causes of migration" (257).

Resource degradation is the first threat to human rights analysed in the book. The three chapters analysing this threat do so through examinations of the climate change–migration–human rights nexus; violations of the right to water by nonstate actors; and global trade-offs between environmental protection and human rights. The analyses in these chapters together present a multifaceted view of the relationship between resources and human rights, highlighting the structural threats to resource-based human rights in international law and accountability processes. While the chapters each contribute an interesting perspective to academic debate surrounding resource deprivation and human rights violations, there is little analysis of migration. Smith-Cannoy does provide a summary in the book's concluding chapter that argues that such resource deprivation creates human rights threats, which in turn act as push factors for survival migrants. While this conclusion indeed has merit, the empirical evidence to support the argument is lacking in the associated chapters. Overall, the chapters on resource degradation lack analytical clarity. In chapters 1 and 3, an overreliance on normative arguments and circumstantial relationships between policy goals and environmental factors detracts from the explanatory power of the analyses. Similarly, the central assumption that environmental protection and human rights protection are mutually exclusive is problematic. However, the analysis of barriers to nonstate actor accountability in chapter 2 presents an innovative perspective on the structural challenges to holding actors accountable for human rights violations. The analysis and findings are thought provoking and undoubtedly contribute to academic literature on human rights.

In order to analyse violence as the second threat to human rights, the contributors examine violence perpetrated on forced migrants in host states; continued violence after ceasefires; and the efficacy of transitional justice mechanisms (TJM) for increasing levels of human rights. The chapters together present a comprehensive analysis of militia and state-based violence and peace efforts as threats to

migrants and citizens. Little emphasis is placed on analysing violence as a migration push factor, with the majority of the analysis focusing on the impact of violence on the human rights of migrants and native populations. However, the results of the analyses indeed provide deeper insight into how violence and actions taken to address violence can perpetuate or lessen human rights violations against migrants and citizens. While the analyses presented in chapters 4–6 examine how violence affects human rights, they do not address why such violence occurs. The suggested human security framework in chapter 4 succeeds in highlighting how insecurity can come from both sending and receiving countries, but it does not provide deeper understanding of the core drivers of violence against refugees. Similarly, it is difficult to conclusively determine which group is ultimately perpetuating violence against civilians – the government or militants – due to a lack of clarity surrounding why governments would pursue ceasefires. Furthermore, in chapter 5, it is possibly not incentives or the type of violence itself that cause the changes in observed post-ceasefire violence, but rather cultural norms and relationships between actors. Similarly, the conclusion reached in chapter 6 that tribunals (justice-based TJMs) are better at achieving human rights goals than other types of TJMs, conflicts with the finding that states are more likely to use peace-based TJMs. This raises the question of why countries would be more likely to choose a less effective form of TJM, which may be due to deeper cultural drivers or norms rather than a logic of consequences, as assumed in the chapter.

Finally, the contributors analyse deprivation of citizenship as the third threat to human rights. Together, chapters 7–9 present a comprehensive analysis of citizenship-based threats to human rights from a variety of sources, including active deprivation of citizenship and associated rights in Burma; structurally created deprivation of citizenship due to bureaucratic demands of the European Union (EU) asylum system; and deprivation of human rights due to the political and economic conditions of host states. The holistic nature of the analyses is compelling, especially the migrant-centric analysis of access to rights under a variety of conditions. However, the arguments presented in chapters 7–9 assume problematic causal linkages that undermine the robustness of the arguments presented. In chapter 7, although deprivation of citizenship for the Rohingya and cross-border migration may indeed be closely linked, it is difficult to disentangle the causal connections between deprivation of citizenship, trafficking of Rohingya refugees, active violence on the part of the Burmese military and related groups, and cross-border migration. It is therefore difficult to pinpoint the cause of mass migration from Burma – deprivation of citizenship, human trafficking, or targeted violence. In chapter 8, the authors argue that statelessness and subsequent trafficking in the EU originates from the failures of the supranational and member state asylum systems. It is, however, the lack of recognition by the country of origin that renders a person stateless, not denial of refugee status due to structural failings in European asylum systems. Furthermore, the connection between these systemic failures and trafficking is underdeveloped. Nonetheless, the unique perspective on causes of statelessness does raise interesting questions. Does statelessness matter only if it is recognised, either by the stateless person or the immigration official? How do states draw a definitive line between refugees and stateless people. What duties do host states hold towards stateless asylum applicants? How should these duties be governed at the state and supranational levels? Finally, the analysis and the conclusion in chapter 9 that responsibility sharing amongst states is the key to providing survival migrants with the opportunity “to thrive”, does not adequately consider domestic politics. For example, efforts to institute responsibility-sharing relocation schemes amongst states, notably attempted by the EU in 2015, have failed due to a lack of domestic and international political will.

While the book overall presents a complex, holistic analysis of threats to human rights, the causal connection between deprivation of rights and forced migration remains tenuous. This is primarily due to the paucity of analysis of the human rights–migration nexus in each chapter, which shifts the stated aim of the book to the analytical margins rather than acting as a central theme. A general lack of empirical evidence to support many of the claims and conceptual confusion between migrants, asylum seekers, stateless persons, and refugees detract from the overall arguments made throughout the book. The book overall also assumes the primacy of international law and ignores the reality that, while these laws are used

to give legal foundation to domestic, regional, and international law, they are often not implemented or enforced. Despite this, the book succeeds in offering interesting insights into the challenges that emerging threats to human rights pose to the future of humanity.

Bibliography

Betts, A. 2013. *Survival Migration: Failed Governance and the Crisis of Displacement*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.